

GIOVANNI MARTINO CESARE AND HIS EDITORS

Howard Weiner

A remark in Jeffrey Quick's review of the recording, "Seventeenth-Century Italian Trombone Sonatas" (*HBS Newsletter* 2 [1990]: 16), reminded me once again of the shabby treatment suffered by Giovanni Martino Cesare at the hands of his modern editors. Since Cesare's collection *Musicali melodie* (Munich: Nikolaus Heinrich, 1621) is of considerable interest to most cornetto and baroque trombone players, and since most of these players do not have access to the original print, or a copy thereof, I have decided to make a list of errata, with commentary.

The only complete surviving copy of *Musicali melodie*, in the Proske-Musikbibliothek in Regensburg, was long thought to have been lost during the Second World War. Actually it was just very jealously guarded by the library. This copy is slightly damaged: the corner of page 15 (unnumbered) of the first partbook is torn, resulting in the loss of several notes. A copy of the second partbook is in the Frankfurt Stadt- und Universitätsbibliothek, and some of the pieces are incompletely preserved in a manuscript in the Sächsische Landesbibliothek, Dresden (Mus. Pi 8). Around the turn of the century, Alfred Einstein, musicologist and cousin of the physicist, made a score of the collection's instrumental pieces ("A Collection of Instrumental Music of the 16th to the 18th Century, Copied by Dr. Alfred Einstein and Housed in the Music Library of Smith College," vol. 3). This score has been used as the source for two of the editions listed below.

Cesare's title page reads:

MUSICALI MELODIE per voci et instrumenti à una, due, tre, quattro, cinque, e sei di Gio. Martino Cesare Musico, & Instrumentista del Serenissimo Massimiliano Con: Palat: del Rheno Duca dell' Alta è Bassa Baviera &c. In Monaco appresso Nicolao Hanrico M.DC. XXI.

The print consists of four partbooks (labelled *prima parte*, *seconda parte*, *terza parte*, and *partitura continua per l'organo*) in quarto format. The title page and the *tavola* of the *partitura* book are reproduced in facsimile in the editions of the Capella Antiqua series discussed below. Each of the partbooks contains the dedication (in Italian, and dated Jan. 25, 1621) to the brothers Georg, Hieronymus, Maximilian, and Johann Fugger, members of the wealthy and influential Augsburg banking family. As Konrad Ruhland points out in the informative foreword to his editions, the titles of the first six of the collection's fourteen instrumental pieces also refer to the Fuggers and their home town: *La Foccarina*, "Fugger," *La Giorgina*, "Georg," *La Massimiliana*, "Maximilian," *La Augustana*, "Augsburg." The other titles refer to attributes: *La Costanza*, "resolution;" *La Famosa*, "fame;" *La Gioia*, "joy;" to places: *La Bavara*,

"Bavaria;" *La Monachina*, "Munich;" or are descriptive: *Ecco*, "echo;" *La Fenice*, "the phoenix;" *La Vittoria*, "victory." The remaining fourteen works in the collection are motets or sacred concertos, of which eleven are for two-to-four voices with organ continuo, and three for voice(s), obbligato instrument(s) and continuo. (*Jubilate Deo* is for two sopranos, bass, cornetto, and basso continuo; *Beate es Virgo Maria*, for tenor, three trombones, and continuo; and *Benedicam Dominum*, for two sopranos, tenor, two cornettos, and continuo.)

A word about accidentals: The manner in which the accidentals appear in the original print has caused some confusion among the editors. The basso continuo figures in the organ part are printed *above* the notes. These have been correctly transcribed for the most part. Occasionally, in the basso continuo part, accidentals (usually sharps) are found *below* the notes. These are simply normal accidentals, not part of the basso continuo figuring. Some editors, however, have (1) omitted them, (2) included them as part of the continuo figuring, (3) transcribed them correctly (by placing them before the note they affect), or (4) treated them inconsistently. Another source of confusion concerns accidentals which in the original appear *after* the note which they affect. This was a fairly common typographical error, and the correct transcription is usually obvious; but even here the editors have sometimes chosen to ignore these accidentals or to print them incorrectly (that is to say, after the note).

The critical notes show where the editions are at variance with the source. This includes not only wrong notes in the editions, but also omissions, and editorial additions and corrections not clearly identified as such. Accidentals present in the original but deleted in the editions to conform to modern practice have been noted, as have those incorrectly printed in the original (after the notes, even when they have been correctly transcribed). Accidentals printed below the notes in the original are noted only where their transcription is incorrect.

NOTE: Cesare's instrumental works are discussed below in ascending order according to the number of instruments required—following the organization of the original print. Modern editions for each piece are listed after the titles of the pieces they contain. Multiple editions are listed chronologically, by date of publication. In the critical notes, the following abbreviations apply: **b.c.** = basso continuo; **bt.** = beat; **cto** = cornetto; **fig.** = figure; **m.** = measure; **n.** = note; **tbn** = trombone; **org** = organ, **orig.** = original.

La Foccarina and *La Giorgina* — Cornetto à vero Violino Solo

Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6011. Munich: Max Hieber, 1977.

La Foccarina:

Cto: m.36, nn.5 and 6 tied in orig., likewise m.37, nn. 5-6; m.39, last note, to m.40, n.1; m.40, last note, to m.41, n.1; m.48, nn.1-2; and m.54, nn.1-2. **Org:** m.36, n.3, b.c. fig., †; m.37, n.4, orig. fig. 76; m.57, n.3, d' in orig.,

b probably correct.

La Giorgina:

Cto: m.9, n.1, d"; m.18, n.1, # editorial; m.31, n.5, # after note in orig.

Org: m.15, n.6, #; m.19, n.3, b.c. fig., #; m.22, n.6, # editorial.

La Hieronyma - Trombone ò Viola Solo

- 1) Glenn Smith, ed. Music for Brass, no. 418. North Easton, MA: Robert King, 1972.
- 2) Konrad Ruhland, ed. Capella Antiqua, MH 6012. Munich: Max Hieber, 1977.
- 3) Klemens Schnorr, ed. Zumikon, Switzerland: Editions Marc Reift, 1989.

As Jeffrey Quick notes in the review cited above, "Borrow . . . alters the rhythm in m. 28, . . . which does not materially improve the voice leading, but does stop the rhythmic drive dead." The mistake was not in altering the rhythm but rather in the choice of edition. Obviously the edition used was that of **Glenn Smith**, whose source was a microfilm of Einstein's transcription. Einstein's very fine handwriting is often difficult to read on a microfilm reader, and this is the source of some of the edition's problems. Note values have been halved.

Tbn: m.7, n.4, d' #; m.24, n.3, # editorial but probably correct; m.27, last note should be dotted, i.e., an eighth tied to a sixteenth in m.28; m.28, nn.3 and 4, thirty-seconds; n.6, dotted eighth; nn. 9 and 10, thirty-seconds; m.33, suggested deletion of n.7 to take a breath should not be taken seriously. **Org:** m.1, n.5, # editorial; m.7, n.4, B^b.

My copy of Smith's edition is from ca. 1974. Some of the errors have been corrected in subsequent printings, but Smith's editorial additions (dynamics, articulations, and phrasings) are best ignored.

Konrad Ruhland's edition of *La Hieronyma* is for the most part accurate. Original note values and clefs have been retained. In addition to a trombone part in the original alto and tenor clefs, a part in octave-treble clef is included.

Tbn: m. 17, nn.1 and 2, f'-d' (octave-treble-clef version only); m.19, n.2, e'; m.25, nn. 5, 7, and 10, c' # (# after each of the three notes in orig.); in the tbn. part, the measure marked "36" is actually "37;" m.39, fermata.
Org: m.3, n.6, c # (# below note in orig.); m.17, n.4, B^b; m.39, fermata.

Here, as in other pieces of this series, Ruhland suggests the viola da gamba as an alternative to the trombone. However, Cesare specifies only "viola," most probably intending a member of the viola da braccio family.

The edition by **Klemens Schnorr** is in many ways similar to that by Ruhland. Indeed, the congruence of errors in the two editions leads one to suspect that Schnorr did not use the original print as his source. The errata given above for Ruhland's edition are also applicable here, with the following additions:

Tbn: m.24, n.3, ♯ editorial; m.38, n.13, half note d' in orig. (remaining notes in this measure are editorial). **Org:** m.8, n.2, whole note e in orig. (n.3 editorial); m.14, rhythm in orig. is half note, dotted half, quarter, half; m. 20, bt. 2, half note f♯ in orig. (eighth and sixteenth notes in this measure are editorial); m.21, beat 4, half note g ♯ in orig. (eighths and sixteenths editorial); m.30, bt. 4, quarter notes a and g in orig. (eighths and sixteenths editorial).

As can be seen in the critical notes, Schnorr has added ornaments to both parts, without indicating that they are editorial. While this is not the place to discuss the appropriateness of ornamentation, I do believe that it is something to be left to the discretion of the performer, and not something to be arbitrarily fixed by an editor.

La Massimiliana and La Ioannina—Due Cornetti ò vero Violini

Konrad Ruhland, ed. Capella Antiqua, MH 6013. Munich: Max Hieber, 1979.

Note: This volume of the Capella Antiqua series is the only one in which the editor has supplied phrasing marks.

La Massimiliana:

Cto 1: m.3, n.4, f'; m.11, n.5, ♯ editorial; m.30, nn.7 and 8, ♯ 's editorial; m.67, n.3, fermata. **Cto 2:** m.10, n.1, ♯ editorial; n.2, f♯ ; n.3, g'♯ ; m.17, n.5, ♯ editorial; m.22, n.5, ♯ editorial; m.31, n.3, ♯ editorial; m.67, n.2, fermata. **Org:** m.8, n.2, b.c. fig., ♯ ; m.18, n.4, ♯ editorial; m.22, n.6, ♯ before note in orig. (probably intended as b.c. fig.); m.67, n.1, ♯ after note in orig.; n.3, fermata.

La Ioannina:

Cto I: m.40, n.3, ♯ orig. **Org:** m.17, n.1, tie from preceding page missing.

La Augustana - Cornetto e Trombone

Ed. Konrad Ruhland. Capella Antiqua, MH 6014. Munich: Max Hieber, 1979.

Cto: m.25, after n.1, add whole note f', delete rest. **Tbn:** m.39, n.7, c'♯. **Org:** m.13, n.7, f♯ , (♯ below note in orig., indicating D-major first-

inversion chord in the b.c. realization); m.33, n.1, c# (# below note in orig., indicating A-major first-inversion chord in the b.c. realization; delete b.c. fig.); m.35, n.5, c #, (# below note in orig., indicating A-major first-inversion chord in b.c. realization; delete b.c. fig.); m.40, n.8, † editorial; m.45, n.5, half note in orig., quarter probably correct.

La Costanza, La Famosa and La Gioia

Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6015. Munich: Max Hieber, 1988.

The other volumes of the *Capella Antiqua* series appeared between 1977 and 1983. The present volume followed in 1988, and seems to have been edited according to different editorial principles, at least as concerns the continuo part. (Measure numbers are also lacking!). In the earlier volumes the figures in the continuo part are limited to those found in the original print and an occasional editorial figure. The three pieces in this volume, however, have been literally flooded with editorial figures which are hardly ever notated as such. The edition gives an incorrect spelling of the title of the first piece: *La Costanza*.

La Costanza — Due Cornetti ò vero Violini e Trombone:

Cto 1: m.13, nn. 6 and 10, c" # ; m.14, n.4, g' # ; m.15, n.13, c" # ; m.23, n.9, e"; m.24, n.3, c" # ; after n.12 add sixteenth notes a', g', forming a decuplet; m.25, n.1, f; m.28, after n.9, add sixteenth notes g'-f', forming a decuplet; n.10, e'; m.61, fermata. **Cto 2:** m.14, n.9, # after note in orig.; m.24, after n.9 add sixteenth notes a'-g', forming a decuplet; n.10, f; m.28, after n.7 add sixteenth notes g', f', forming a decuplet; n.8, e'; m.35, n.5, a' in orig., but b' probably correct; m.56, nn.1 and 2 tied; m.61, fermata. **Tbn:** m.4, n.10, c' # ; m.10, n.6, c' # ; m.13, nn.12 and 14, c' # ; m.15, n.2, # editorial; m.16, n.4, f# ; m.61, add fermata. **Org:** m.53, n.6, # above note in orig., indicating a b.c. fig., probably a misprint (the transcription as an accidental is probably correct; see parallel passage, m.55); m.56, n.4, B in orig., but A probably correct; m.57, nn.1 and 2 tied; m.61, fermata. The following b.c. figs. are orig., all others editorial: m.35, nn.3, 5; m.36; m.43, m.44.

The editor obviously did not believe that an early Baroque composer was capable of writing a decuplet. Each of the four times this figure appears in *La Costanza*, Ruhland drops the last two sixteenth notes and moves the last (half) note up a third in order to squeeze it into a "normal" form.

La Famosa — Due Cornetti, ò vero Violini e Trombone o Viola:

Org: m.24, n.1, breve in orig.; n.2 editorial but probably correct (compare

tbn part); all figs. editorial.

La Gioia—Due Cornetti ò vero Violini e Trombone:

Cto 1: m.23, n.6, f" # ; m.33, n.7, # editorial; m.45, n.9, g' # ; m.51, n.4 missing in orig. **Cto 2:** m.32, n.7, # editorial. **Org:** m.47, n.1, f in orig. Orig. figures: m.16, m.20; m.31, n.2; m.33, m.34, nn. 2, 4, 6, and 8; m.35, nn. 2, 4, and 6; m.36; m.39; m.40, n.3; m.41; m.42; m.43; m.44; m.45; all other figs. editorial.

Measure 43 presents a problem in the cornetto parts: the rhythm does not work. In the first cornetto part, the original has one quarter note too many, while in the second cornetto there are three sixteenths too many. I can almost accept Ruhland's solution, except that I would change the second cornetto part as follows: delete n.17 (an editorial addition in any case), replace dotted-eighth and quarter rests following n.17 with (original) half rest.

Ecco - 3 Cornetti ò vero Violini in Eccho

Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6016. Munich: Max Hieber, 1979.

Cto 1: m.29, nn.9, 11, 13, and 17, g" # ; m.37, n.3, sixteenth; after n.7 add sixteenth note g" . **Cto 2:** m.30, nn.9 and 15, g" # (# 's incorrectly placed in orig., before nn. 8 and 14). **Cto 3:** m.13, n.8, c"; mm. 16 and 18, nn.1 and 2 tied in orig.; m.28, n.12, a"; n.13, g" # ; m.29, n.8, g" # . **Org:** m.10, nn.1-2 tied in orig.

La Bavara - 4 Tromboni

1) Glenn Smith, ed. *International Trombone Association Series*, no. 7. Nashville: Brass Press, 1977.

2) Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6017. Munich: Max Hieber, 1980.

3) William Runyan, ed. *Monteux: Musica Rara*, 1981.

Glenn Smith once again used a microfilm of Einstein's score as the source for his edition. Note values have been halved in the first triple section. The continuo line has been given to a fifth trombone. This part is however not usable as a continuo part since a number of measures have been omitted. In mm. 92-97 Smith filled out the harmony using trombones 1-4 for his continuo realization.

Tbn 1: m.46, n.3, g'; mm.95-96, rests in orig. **Tbn 2:** m.74, n.2, # after note in orig; mm. 95-97, rests in orig. **Tbn 3:** m.59, quarter rest editorial; m. 104, # editorial. **Tbn 3, 4:** mm.92-94, rests in orig. **Tbn 5:** m.1, whole

note G; m.2, whole note d; m.3, half notes G, g; m.4, whole note a; m.5, quarter notes g, G, G, G; m.24, half notes g, g, C; m.25, idem; m.26, whole note g, half rest; m.27, half notes c, c, f; m.28, idem; m.29, whole note c, half rest; m.55, n.2., b.c. fig., # ; m.71, nn. 1-2, b.c. figs. # 's; m.74, nn.1 and 3, b.c. figs., # 's; m.75, n.1, b.c. fig., # ; m.78, n.1, b.c. fig., # ; m.91, D; m.92, half notes d, d, a; m.93, half notes d, d, A; m.95, half notes A, A, e; m.96, half notes A, A, E.

The title probably refers to Bavaria and not, as Smith suggests, to "the Bavarian woman." Also here, Smith's editorial additions are best ignored.

Konrad Ruhland's edition retains the original note values but uses bass and transposing treble clefs instead of the original tenor and alto clefs. Ruhland seems to have had trouble keeping the original and editorial accidentals straight. Thirty original sharps and flats have been printed above the notes—the usual method of notating editorial suggestions.

The trombone parts are not numbered in the original print. If one assumes the part printed in the *prima parte* book to be trombone 1, then Ruhland has switched the first two parts around. His trombone 1 is found in the *seconda parte* book.

Tbn 1 (Tbn 2 in the other editions): m.44, n.6, # orig.; m.48, n.9, ^b orig.; m.50, n.2, # after note in orig.; m.58, n.7, # orig.; m.70, n. 6, c'; n.7, d'. **Tbn 2:** m.42, n.6, # orig.; m.44, n.4, # orig.; m.45, nn.1-3, add editorial # 's; nn. 7 and 8, add beam (part only); m.46, n.4, # orig.; m.47, n.2, e'; m.49, n.2, # orig.; m.52, n.4, # orig.; m.54, n.6, # orig. **Tbn 3:** m.3, n.9, # orig.; m.8, n.1, # orig.; m.11, n.1, # orig.; m.37, nn.2 and 3, # 's orig.; m.40, # orig.; m.43, n.1, quarter note in orig. (which should be preceded by an editorial quarter rest); m.44, n.4, # orig.; m.47, n.4, # orig.; m. 51, n.2, # orig.; m.57, n.1, ^b orig.; m.68, n.5, ^b orig. **Tbn 4:** m.2, n.9, # orig., m.7, n.1, # orig.; m.10, nn. 1 and 4, # 's orig.; m.11, nn. 9 and 11, # 's orig.; m.50, n.7, # orig.; m.52, n.7, # orig.; m.53, n.5, ^b orig.; m.69, n.1, ^b editorial. **Org:** m.4, n.8, c# (# below note in orig.; the b.c. realization should therefore show an A-major first-inversion chord); m.45, b.c. fig. editorial; m.47, idem.

William Runyan has supplied us with an accurate transcription of *La Bavara*. The only divergence from the original text is in the organ part at measure 94, where he has deleted the dot of the half note and added an editorial quarter rest. Note values have been quartered in the first triple section, halved in the second. Editorial accidentals are clearly notated as such.

La Monachina - 3 Cornetti e Trombone

Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6018. Munich: Max Hieber, 1983.

All parts: m.49, add fermata. **Cto 2:** m.13, nn.9-12 missing in orig. (page damaged; see parallel passage, mm.9-10); m.14, nn.7 and 8, d". **Tbn:** part in bass clef (orig. tenor clef); m.23, n.13, f in orig., g probably correct. **Org:** m.13, before n.1, add eighth note a, delete rest; m.35, n.3, b.c. fig., # editorial or error; m.39, n.3, b.c. figure, # .

La Fenice - Due Cornetti (ò vero Violini) e due Tromboni

Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6019. Munich: Max Hieber, 1979.

Those of you who have played this edition may have noticed several rather strange transitions. These are not the result of a sudden flight of fancy on Cesare's part; rather, at some point between the editor's putting the work into score and the engraving of the plates, a couple of pages were switched around. In order to use this edition, you must play mm. 1-12, followed by 24-34, then 13-23, and ending with 35-47. (I wrote to the publishers a couple of years ago, but I do not know whether subsequent printings have been corrected, or even if there have been subsequent printings. I do know of a recording, with gamba consort, using this edition.) In addition:

Cto 2: m.29, n.2, d"; n.3, c". **Tbn** parts in bass clef (orig. baritone clef).
Tbn 1: m.25, n.2, e in orig., but d probably correct. **Org:** m.33, n.1, b.c. fig., # .

La Vittoria - 3 Cornetti e 3 Tromboni

Konrad Ruhland, ed. *Capella Antiqua*, MH 6020. Munich: Max Hieber, 1980.

Here also Ruhland has problems with the accidentals: thirty-three original sharps and flats are notated as if they were editorial additions.

Cto 1: m.37, nn.16, 18, and 20, # 's incorrectly placed in orig., before notes 15, 17, and 19 (parallel passage in cto 3 correctly notated); m.50, n.3, ♭ orig.; m.52, n.1, # orig.; m.55, after n.1 add half note rest and half note d" (error in score only). **Cto 2:** m.36, n.7, # after note in orig.; n.10, # orig.; m.38, nn.12, 14, and 16, # 's incorrectly placed in orig., before nn. 11, 13, and 15 (parallel passage in cto 3 correct); m.44, n. 4, half note (error in score only); m.45, n.1, # orig.; n.2, add editorial ♯; m.46, n.1, # orig.; m.49, n.1, # after note in orig.; m.50, n.8, # orig.; m.52, n.3, ♭; m.53, n.8, f";

m.54, n.5, ♯ orig. **Cto 3:** m.38, nn. 9 and 11, ♯ 's orig.; n.17, † editorial; m.44, n.5, ♯ orig.; m.54 after n.4 add whole note e" (error in score only). **Tbn parts in bass clef (orig. alto and tenor clefs).** **Tbn 1:** m.15, last n., g'; m.16, n.1, ♯ orig.; m.35, n. 9, ♯ after note in orig.; n. 10, d'; m.40, n.5, ♯ orig.; m.41, nn. 1 and 3, ♯ 's orig.; m.47, n.1 ♯ orig.; m.48, n.6, ♯ orig.; m.53, n.1, ♯ orig. **Tbn 2:** m.16, n.5, ♯ orig.; m.40, nn. 1, 3, 4, and 7, ♯ 's orig.; m.46, nn.3 and 4, ♯ 's orig.; m.52, n.1, c'♯, indicating a major third in the b.c. realization. **Org:** m.13, n. 2, b.c. fig., ♯ .

Giovanni Martino Cesare has taken quite a beating from his editors. I must admit that I was not aware of the extent of the damage as I started writing this article. If it seems that I have been overly pedantic, especially concerning the accidentals, it is because I feel that the performer should have as much information at his/her disposal in order to make qualified decisions. A good solution for those performers not prepared to play from facsimile is surprisingly found in two editions from the Capella Antiqua series, in which Cesare's works also appeared. The two "Canzonati" by J.G.F. Braun (MH 6004 and MH 6008), for four violins and basso continuo, and four trombones and basso continuo, respectively, include facsimiles of the original parts on the reverse side of the modern parts. This solution is of course not always feasible, be it on account of the additional expense involved, or because of the poor condition of many original prints and manuscripts. In any case, I believe that when someone purchases a modern edition he/she has a right to expect that editor and publisher have taken care to produce a reliable and usable edition. As we have seen, this unfortunately is not always the case.

Howard Weiner is a free-lance musician residing in Hamburg, Germany. He studied trombone with Frank Crisafulli at Northwestern University and early music at the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis.